

APPENDIX C

Feedback from Consultation on Catherine Dalley House

1. The comments received from the on line and paper questionnaires made available through the Consultation on the future of Catherine Dalley House which ran from 23 June – 21 September 2015 are summarised below. A total of 227 comments were received, expressing a range of views.
2. Overall, about two thirds of respondents disagree strongly or tend to disagree with the proposal to close Catherine Dalley House – with around one third agreeing strongly or tending to agree. Among those who disagree with the proposals, many are relatives and staff (both present and past) from Catherine Dalley House. A summary of the comments received for each category are given below – direct quotations are in italics.
3. Some of the concerns expressed are addressed in the main Cabinet Report – for example assurances are given that residents needs will be assessed prior to any move, and no resident will be financially disadvantaged.

Catherine Dalley House offers a very good service and should be kept open;

4. There were many very positive comments about Catherine Dalley house and the service it offers, including praise for the staff
 - CDH is a *'flagship'* care home and *'a wonderful facility for the people of Melton and around'*.
 - There is a very real need for a Council run home in Leics to provide a good model of care: *'I am not aware of any other home in Melton that provides this specialist care'*
 - Closure would be highly detrimental to the current residents and excellent staff: *'The residents and staff are real people, not calculations on a page'*
 - People in the borough of Melton Mowbray should be able to access this well respected and trustworthy care environment in their vulnerable old age.
 - The home is a good environment – it is described as *'calm and restful'*; Another comment was that *'No other home in Melton or Loughborough or surrounding areas matches it'*;
 - Catherine Dalley House staff are very good and professional in their approach – they are described as *'A fantastic bunch of professionals'*;
 - There is good communication with local people;
 - Catherine Dalley House is a real home to the residents;

There is an acceptance that the building in its current state requires improvement, although a number of responses say that this is outweighed by the excellent service provided – *'they want a home not a hotel'*. There are comments saying that the building should not have been allowed to fall into disrepair in the first place.

Agreement with the proposal to close

5. A number of comments have been made in support of closure:
 - Effective support and better facilities could be offered to residents by moving them and releasing the current site to make savings/other uses;
 - *'despite running a good service at CDH, the Authority needs to make substantial savings and suitable alternatives for residents would be available'*;
 - *'Economic needs and sense'*;
 - Other services are just as good if not better
 - If the building is not fit for purpose and it would be too expensive to upgrade then this needs to be considered.
 - The Home is in need of updating – with the property next door (Silverdale) empty this site would be of high value for affordable housing.

The consequences of closure

There are a number of comments around the consequences of closure

- It will cost the Council a lot of money to rehouse residents and make its staff redundant.
 - Closure will mean a negative effect on the area including job losses.
 - Catherine Dalley House and Silverdale are part of Melton Mowbray history. These building should be preserved, not demolished.
 - The Council should not dispose of its assets.
6. There are a few comments around the Council needing a clear strategy for older people in future and retaining assets – there is a suggestion that the two cottages and Silverdale should have been let to generate income. There is also a comment that if the home was full it would pay for itself. It is also noted that £150,000 is a relatively small saving given all the disruption closure would cause.

The impact on Residents

7. There is concern expressed about the impact on residents of the Home closing, and residents being required to relocate:
 - The needs of current residents should be paramount, at least until they no longer require care...*A monetary value should not be placed on the value of a peaceful end of life for the current residents.*
 - Residents should not have to move at this time of their lives
 - *'The quality of care for elderly people is of greater importance than the physical properties and condition of the building'*
 - It is crucial that the opinions of those most affected be taken into account. It is not good to move people with dementia to new surroundings.

Capacity of the local care market

8. A number of comments disputed that the local care market has capacity to fill the gap left if Catherine Dalley House were to close.

- Not enough hours are available for people who are unable to access private care. Other homes in Melton all require a third party top up.
- There are still enquiries being received for Catherine Dalley House, which has an excellent reputation backed up by CQC reports
- There is a need for a Council run home in Leicestershire; private care is nowhere near as good.
- The Council is abnegating its responsibilities by handing things over to the private sector.
- The 91 bed home will not be ready in time to take Catherine Dalley House residents – there is not sufficient capacity locally.
- There is a shortage of care homes; there are not enough vacancies to rehouse Catherine Dalley House residents;
- If demand for places in Melton is still being satisfied following the reduction in places at Catherine Dalley House, why has permission been granted for a home with 91 bedspaces?
- Are there potential residents who would prefer to be in Melton Mowbray currently in homes outside of Melton because of this deliberate 'wind down'?
- Homes are struggling; people will be located far away.
- Sufficient capacity in this context means a bed in a home it does not necessarily mean in a home with a homely friendly environment.
- The elderly population is growing – there are not enough care beds

9. There is also a comment made about the location of Catherine Dalley house:

'The local care market assessment does not sufficiently consider the impact on relatives and residents based locally without access to public transport. In an area of social isolation this is a key decision - to close would disproportionality disadvantage those on lower incomes'.

'Loss of a facility within walking distance for relatives would cause loss of contact for residents'

10. The Consultation asked if people could suggest additional measures to reduce any negative impacts of the proposals, and alternative ideas for providing the best possible support and services for older people within the resources available. The following summarises comments made on both areas:

Measures to reduce the negative impacts of moving

- It would be disruptive to residents to move – needs must be appropriately assessed and they should be allowed to move as a group if possible and retain the support of existing carers;
- Residents should have choice over where they go – not too far from Catherine Dalley House;

- Residents should not have to pay more for any accommodation they move to;
- Relatives and staff should be involved in any relocation of residents
- There needs to be time allowed for any transition;
- Catherine Dalley House should be kept open until there are too few residents left for it to run effectively;
- Residents should be allowed to remain in CDH for the rest of their lives;
- There needs to be adequate support put in place from the independent sector;
- It is important that alternatives are found a few miles from CDH that meet residents' needs;
- Let residents visit alternative homes to see what's available;
- Transfers must be handled carefully and with great care,
- *'I assume that all staff directly involved in assisting transfers will be aware of the sensitivity required and in addition are fully trained and conversant with the effects of the specific disabilities affecting current residents'.*

Alternatives

Some ideas for alternatives are expressed:

- If there is demand why not use Catherine Dalley House to its full potential? The Council should update this home and build another;
- The whole service should be relocated in a fit for purpose building in Melton;
- Catherine Dalley House should be renovated - it could be a lead setting for care of people with dementia;
- Catherine Dalley House could provide a mixture of long-term, rehabilitation and respite services – some beds could be commissioned out to health;
- Updating CDH and Silverdale would give scope to have day facilities, providing more jobs and more income to Melton;
- The Council should build a retirement village or extra care scheme;
- Upgrade the buildings and create jobs in the community.
- Increase council tax and reduce salaries of top staff;
- Reduce money on consultation exercises and invest in services.